

space is devoted to the Talmud, but again it is *about* the Talmud. There is a description of the hermeneutic principles employed, about the spread of the Talmud in space and influence—but we find nothing of what the Talmud contained or how it grew out of and how it affected the every day life of the people. Indeed, we find nothing descriptive of the life of the people. If, as the author claims, “the religion of Israel is . . . the participation of a whole people in an experience that is lived . . .,” how can we know this religion except through the life of the people?

The virtue of consistency—of emphasizing the “spirit” above the “letter,” “faith” above “deed”—leads the author to such questionable evaluations as: “. . . the most popular doctor of the synagogue, the unquestioned master of Jewish spirituality, the most constant source of the mystical inspiration of Judaism: Bahya ibn Pakuda” or “. . . *The Guide for the Perplexed*, the most complete summing up of Rabbinic Judaism.”

It comes as no surprise that the *Kabbalah* is presented as the supreme expression of Judaism in the second millennium of the exile. Since we know the author’s emphasis on the holy land in the definition of Judaism, it is not unexpected to find him regard the establishment of the State of Israel as ushering in a new era of revival and revitalization for Judaism. The religio-political situation is described and evaluated with discernment and sympathy.

The concluding section is not of the story of Judaism but of the author’s purpose and place for Judaism and Israel today. He sees its people and faith as the force to bring reconciliation to the children of men. In fulfilment of Isaiah’s prophecy, Jerusalem is to become the spiritual center of western man. The people Israel has the source and power to bring salvation to all the world.

Prophecy aside, Chouraqui has little to say of modern Judaism, except that he is unhappy with attempts at adjustment of Judaism to modern life. All accommodation is revocation.

One misses the names and contributions to modern religious thought of Rosenzweig, Kook, Buber, Heschel, and Kaplan. There are those who see greater worth and promise for Judaism in their thought and message than in the political activity of the religious parties in the State of Israel.

In sum, Andre Chouraqui has written a readable, sympathetic, thoughtful little volume. It is a useful survey of Judaism as seen through a Christian mind and heart. It is a good book *about* Judaism. It is not an authentic delineation of the faith and the way of life of the Jewish people.

Rochester, New York.

ABRAHAM J. KARP.

LIEBERMAN, SAUL; ABRAMSON, SHRAGA; KUTSCHER, EZEKIEL Y.; ESH, SHAUL, Eds. ספר חנוך ילון. *Hanoch Yalon Jubilee Volume*. On the Occasion of his Seventy-fifth Birthday. Jerusalem. Kiryat Sefer Publishing House. 1963. Pp. 369.

Hanoch Yalon, to whom this volume is dedicated, is a distinguished Hebrew scholar residing in Israel. He has made some original and notable contributions to the science of Hebrew grammar. He has utilized original sources, ancient and obscure manuscripts, as well as old and living traditions of usage, to blaze new paths in the investigation of the Hebrew language.

However, Yalon has not published any comprehensive works in this field. His contributions comprise, mainly, articles, reviews and comments scattered in various magazines. We are, therefore, indebted to Dr. Shaul Esh for the complete bibliography of Yalon’s writings and, especially, to Professor E. Y. Kutscher for the excellent and illuminating summation of his views, by which this volume

is introduced. In his summation Prof. Kutscher succeeds in bringing into focus Yalon's linguistic method and the significance of his contributions.

Most of Yalon's views are cogent and definitive, while some are still open to challenge. It is difficult, for example, to accept without serious reservations his method of blending the possessive particle *ל* with the subsequent noun (*שְׁלִימוֹסִי*), in his vocalization of the mishnaic texts. His arguments in favor of such blending are unconvincing. The living tradition (outside that of the Yemenite Jews), the printed texts and other evidences militate against it. In all likelihood, this particle was originally blended with the noun during the early stages of the language, as demonstrated by the few examples found in the Bible, but eventually it was detached and became a separate lexical unit. This detachment may have occurred quite early, cf. Ecc. 8: 17; also the second Bar Kokhba letter (Y. Kutscher, *Leshonenu*, xxvi, 1).

Of great interest to the student of medieval Hebrew grammar is the publication, by Professor Abramson, of Judah ben Bal'am's *Kitab al-Tajnis* (The Book of Paronymasy). Ben Bal'am was an 11th-century biblical commentator and Hebrew grammarian of distinction, whose works have come down only in fragmentary form. A fragment of the *tajnis* and a Hebrew version by an unknown translator were published, side by side, by Paul Kokowzoff in 1916 (Noviye Materiali, Petrograd). In this volume Professor Abramson publishes the original text, based on newly discovered manuscripts, together with the Hebrew version previously published by Kokowzoff, as well as a fragment of Ben Bal'am's Introduction to this text, never before published. He also provides an adequate introduction and ample annotations.

Professor Z. Ben Hayim, an expert of Samaritan traditions of Hebrew and Aramaic readings, attempts to prove that the Samaritan phonetic tradition postulates a stage which resembles somewhat the Tiberian system of vocalization and accentuation. Furthermore, this tradition points, in his opinion, although indirectly, to a pre-Tiberian stage, when the penultimate accentuation was consistently employed in Hebrew. Only after the eventual falling away of the short unaccented final syllable did the stage of accentuating the final syllable arise as represented in the Tiberian system.

In a beautifully written essay, Mordecai ben Ezekiel extolls the virtues of historical traditions and roots as a factor in human progress and civilization. Without such traditions and roots man, or society, is lonely, drifting, without a goal or direction, pursuing chimeras or will-o'-the-wisps, "naked and empty, suspended in mid-air, where there is neither light nor darkness, only waste and void."

Biblical scholarship is represented by H. L. Ginsberg, who offers some ingenious textual emendations, some of which seem far-fetched. Carried away by his brilliance and penchant for emendations he often tampers too much and needlessly with the biblical text, in violation of the principle of *lectio difficilior* in textual criticism.

Professor Saul Lieberman contributes some observations and comments on some passages in Ruth Rabba. In these comments the distinguished talmudic scholar displays his usual erudition and familiarity with original sources and texts, as well as linguistic versatility and insight.

Dr. Sh. Morag, who wrote a very fine book, both in Hebrew and in English, on the Hebrew language tradition of the Yemenite Jews, turns our attention, in this volume, to the Babylonian Aramaic tradition of the Yemenite Jews. His study covers the verb of Babylonian Aramaic, in all the conjugations and inflections. The grammar of this Aramaic dialect is still, more or less, a virgin field, despite the pioneering works by Margolis, Levias and Epstein. This study, based on one of the oldest phonetic traditions, may help to shed light on this still inadequately ex-

plored field. Much spadework remains to be done in this field before the writing of an authentic and comprehensive grammar of this dialect may be contemplated.

What was actually the Hebrew language in Palestine during the mishnaic period? What was its orthography and its pronunciation? This is the problem to which Prof. Y. Kutscher addresses himself in "The Language of the Sages." The printed texts of the Mishnah are unreliable, in his opinion, since they were undoubtedly tampered with by copyists and "grammarians." The extant manuscripts, including those discovered in the Cairo Genizah, date back, at the earliest, to the end of the second millenium C.E., that is, about 800 years after the Hebrew language ceased being a vernacular (in the author's opinion, which is probably erroneous). Hence they are of little avail in solving the problem. Nor are the Dead Sea Scrolls very helpful in this regard, since they are limited in scope and are unvocalized. Furthermore, "their language was not entirely identical with the language of the Sages available to us." There is, however, one manuscript, maintains Kutscher, which meets the criteria of authenticity and may, therefore, be regarded as an archetype, namely, the Kaufman manuscript. This manuscript, which is vocalized, seems to preserve most authentically the pristine mishnaic Hebrew employed in Palestine up to the end of the 2nd century C.E. Kutscher then proceeds to present examples from this manuscript, which deviate considerably from the accepted system of orthography, phonology and morphology, as recorded in such standard mishnaic grammars as that of M. Z. Segal.

There are other significant contributions in this volume which, for lack of space, will be mentioned only briefly. They are: 1. an essay on Hebrew prosody in Italy, by Aharon Mirsky, who emphasizes the differences between the Sephardi and the Italian Hebrew prosody and traces the latter to the influence of the Tiberian pronunciation where the vocal *shewa* was regarded as a vowel and a *shewa* after a long vowel was silent. 2. a compilation by S. J. Agnon of quotations on the Mishna from rabbinic sources, beginning from *Megilat Ta'anit* down to the latest midrashim, attributed to the rabbinic sages; 3. a discussion by E. S. Rosenthal of the family relationship between Rav and Rabbi Hiyya, based on statements in the Babylonian Talmud; 4. a statement by Y. Shaftiel of principles of mishnaic grammar underlying Yemenite traditional readings, illustrated by the vocalized mishnaic text of Sanhedrin; 5. a study by Hayyim Shirman of the friendly relationship between Ibn Gabirol and Ibn Janah, as portrayed in an Aramaic poem by the poet Ibn Gabirol, dedicated to the grammarian Ibn Janah.

This volume is not a mere motley miscellany of essays. It is well designed. It presents a variegated and integrated picture of the Hebrew language and its literature throughout the ages, covering the manifold aspects of the growth of the language. It is therefore a fitting testimonial to a scholar whose interests and contributions embrace all these aspects of the Hebrew language.

*Dropsie College, Philadelphia.*

WILLIAM CHOMSKY.

LIPMAN, V. D., Ed. *Three Centuries of Anglo-Jewish History*. London. The Jewish Historical Society of England. 1961. Pp. xi, 201.

In 1956, the tercentenary of the resettlement of the Jews in England, the Tercentenary Council, in association with the Jewish Historical Society of England, presented, among its other celebrations commemorating the event, a series of eight lectures by different scholars of Anglo-Jewry. These lectures are published in the volume under review.

In "The Resettlement of the Jews in England," Dr. Cecil Roth, the foremost scholar of Anglo-Jewish history, shows, to the reader's pleasant surprise, that this chapter of Anglo-Jewish history is still open for further investigation. Roth pre-